History Day Judges Evaluation Help Guide

Fill in the blank with your comments:

1. The TOPIC that you chose
   a. Is [circle a description: relevant / interesting / significant] because…

2. Your project's RELATIONSHIP to the theme...
   a. Is [circle a description: clear / strong / interesting] because…
   b. Can be clarified by…
   c. Needs to address….

3. Your THESIS
   a. Is [circle a description: clear / strong / interesting] because…
   b. Is interesting and can be made stronger by…
   c. Needs to be more clearly stated
   d. Needs to be more clearly linked to the theme
   e. Needs to be more clearly linked to your project discussion
   f. Needs to be clearly restated in a concluding statement

4. The HISTORICAL CONTEXT that you provide
   a. Is strong because…
   b. Can be strengthened by…
   c. Is too brief/insufficiently discussed

5. The EVIDENCE that you utilize to support your thesis
   a. Is strong because…
   b. Can be strengthened by…
   c. Is clear though more evidence should be offered by taking a look at [think of other perspectives the student may have missed, sources the student should incorporate, etc.]...
   d. Needs to be emphasized rather than your opinions
   e. Does not support the conclusions/ assertions you make

6. The RESEARCH that you did
   a. Is good but can be strengthened by looking at more primary sources from [think of areas where the student lacks primary source research in and that you think would be accessible & available to students if they did more research such as looking through old newspapers, editorials, etc.]
   b. Need to find more substantive secondary sources such as books or scholarly journal articles - brief websites/encyclopedia articles do not provide enough detail for well researched conclusions

7. Format Comments

Below are some examples of comments to provide regarding Quality of Project:

Essay
Needed to more carefully proofread
Needed to comply with proper citation format
Exceeded the word limit

Website
Needed clearer organization of pages
Needed more images - too heavy a reliance on text
Integrate more visuals e.g. images, video clips, maps
Good use of multiple materials (images, quotes, videos etc.) to tell the story
Exceeded the word/video time limit

Display Board
Good use of images
Need clearer use of headings and/or captions
Needs clearer organization of argument on the board
Exceeded the word limit

Documentary
Good use of images and/or video clips
Effective narration
Too fast/ sound hard to hear etc. (identify things that make it harder to watch and understand)
Exceeded the time limit

Performance
Good use of dramatic format to convey historical story
Powerful presentation
Needed to speak more clearly/slowly
Exceeded the time limit